

FIRST MINISTER'S NATIONAL ADVISORY COUNCIL ON WOMEN AND GIRLS SUMMARY NOTES – 25 AND 26 SEPTEMBER 2019 – EDINBURGH

NACWG MEMBERS

- Amina Ahmed: Scottish Government Fairer Future Codesign Panel
 - Kara Brown: International Legal Officer, Children and Young People's Commissioner Scotland
 - Tressa Burke: CEO, Glasgow Disability Alliance
 - Catherine Calderwood: Chief Medical Officer
 - Vicky Featherstone: Artistic Director, London's Royal Court Theatre – apologies
 - Jacqui Ferguson: Non-Executive Director, Croda Plc, Engineering UK, Tesco Bank and Wood Plc
 - Professor Anne Glover: President, Royal Society of Edinburgh – apologies
 - Dame Katherine Grainger: Chair, UK Women in Sport – apologies
 - Katie Horsburgh: Volunteer Advocate, Girlguiding Scotland
 - Baroness Kennedy of the Shaws: QC – apologies
 - Louise Macdonald OBE: Independent Chair and CEO, Young Scot
 - Satwat Rehman: CEO, One Parent Families Scotland
 - Emma Ritch: Executive Director, Engender – apologies
 - Suki Wan: Vice Chair, Scottish Youth Parliament – apologies
 - Talat Yaqoob: Director, Equate Scotland and Co-Founder, Women 5050 – 24 Sept only
-
- Deborah Fulercik: Scottish Government Support to NACWG
 - Katherine May: Scottish Government Support to NACWG
 - Cat Loudon: Scottish Government Support to NACWG (work experience)

FIRST MINISTER'S NATIONAL ADVISORY COUNCIL ON WOMEN AND GIRLS PRE-EVENT WORKING DINNER

24 September 2019: 13:00 – 20:00 at Radisson Blu, Edinburgh

Members attended a pre-event presentation and workshop ahead of the meeting of the First Minister's National Advisory Council on Women and Girls (NACWG) the following day. The Chair opened proceedings, noted apologies, introduced guests in attendance, including those shadowing NACWG members and officials, and advised who would be joining tomorrow's meeting.

The NACWG received a presentation from 3rd Horizons on the Policy Coherence System mapping report which they produced for the Advisory Council over the summer. NACWG members then took part in facilitated driver diagram workshops to begin to develop their thinking ahead of the 2019 Report and Recommendations.

Meeting Papers

Following the afternoon presentation and workshop the Chair opened the Advisory Council pre-meeting and worked through the agenda for the evening.

The Chair moved systematically through the papers, this included a 'Forward Look' mapping the upcoming NACWG event dates until the end of the initial three year strategy, Round Tables, and Accessibility and Enhancing Engagement. The Chair noted that Round Tables would take place in February next year so that the NACWG can collect insight and develop their thinking ahead of the first Circle of the year on their annual topic in March, as opposed to throughout the year as they did in 2019. All agreed on the importance to survey Circle members to better understand their needs and request feedback on the NACWG impact ahead of the final year of their initial three year strategy.

The Chair then brought proceedings to a close, thanking all for their input throughout the workshop and pre-meeting.

FIRST MINISTER'S NATIONAL ADVISORY COUNCIL ON WOMEN AND GIRLS CIRCLE SESSION

25 September 2019: 10:00 – 12:30 at Out of the Blue Drill Hall, Main Hall

The Circle session was opened by Louise Macdonald OBE, Chair of the NACWG, who welcomed everyone and thanked all Circle members for their continued support in helping the NACWG to advise the First Minister on actions to achieve #GenerationEqual. The Chair then thanked those who have held their own Wee Circles across the country (you can find out more about how to hold your own [here](#)). She also thanked the table discussion facilitators and the NACWG's illustrator in residence, Linda Hunter, who illustrated throughout the event to create a visual narrative of the session. Lastly, the Chair thanked her fellow Advisory Council members for their insight and expertise as well as all 925+ Circle members.

The Chair then explained that the NACWG are looking forward to their first Accountability Day in November where they will be checking in on the progress and action taken by Scottish Government and colleagues on the 2018 Report and Recommendations.

You can watch the Chair's welcome [here](#) and see the PowerPoint slides from day [here](#).

Louise then welcomed joint key note speakers Gary Gillespie, Scottish Government Chief Economist, and Dr Angela O'Hagan, Chair of the Scottish Government's Equality and Budgets Advisory Group and Senior Lecturer in Equality and Public Policy at Glasgow Caledonian University. They discussed the inclusive growth economy, the hidden care economy, the use – or misuse – of data, gender budgeting and feminist economics.

You can watch Gary and Angela's speeches [here](#) and [here](#) and you can see an image of Angela's feminist economics slide [here](#).

The third speaker was Dr Ima Jackson, Co Convenor of Glasgow Refugee Asylum and Migration Network. Ima spoke of the change in demographics over the past 10 years during which migrant communities have grown however, their visibility in society has decreased. She spoke of the importance of listening to and representing people of colour, minorities and refugees to ensure that their expertise of their own experience in communities is adequately reflected in policy making and decision making. You can watch Ima's input [here](#).

The Chair then introduced singer-song writer Beldina Odenyo Onassis, known as *Heir of the Cursed*, who captivated the room with her beautiful and powerful performance which you can watch [here](#). All of this helped to prepare the Circle for the table discussions, digging deeper into our exploration of Policy Coherence.

Following a comfort break the Chair opened the table discussions.

Table Discussion Feedback Summary

The table discussions emphasised the importance of gender budgeting, the use of data, and the need to make participation accessible for all – in doing so, we can reach more communities and hear the voices of Scotland to create coherent policy.

You can see the table discussions in action in this [short clip](#). If you are interested in hosting your own Satellite Wee Circle with your organisation, to discuss the same table discussion questions that are discussed at the main Circle session, there's more information on how you can do so [here](#).

Below you can find a summary of outputs from the table discussions and you can see the Chair's closing remarks from the Circle session [here](#).

Question one

- Good policy making needs input from a wide range of people, how would you want to see this improved for women and girls' participation?

Summary of Responses

Discussions on what attendees would like to see improved to increase women and girls participation in policy making focussed on increasing accessibility. Participation often comes at a cost as people need to take time off work, pay for childcare, travel to the venue etc and these factors act as huge barriers for those in poverty, who are carers, and those in rural and hard to reach communities. Some form of Participatory Fund which recognises the cost of participation would help increase accessibility.

Focus was also placed on increasing accessibility by going out to communities and involving more people in the consultation process. Policy makers could go to places of worship, libraries, GPs, community groups and youth groups as well as hosting workshops (creative mediums), live recordings and webinars. Orkney Library and Zero

Tolerance (who work with journalists and Just Right Scotland) are examples of organisations which have supported participation in harder to reach communities.

Literacy and digital literacy can also act as barriers – do people know what policy is, how it's made and the difference it makes to people lives? Plain English and British Sign Language (BSL) should be used to enable all to participate in a variety of communications, rather than digital tools alone.

Further points on improving participation focussed on gender budgeting (*a way of analysing the budget (economy) for its effect on gender equality*) and the use of disaggregated data. There should be a recognition of the importance of stories and lived experience and this should be viewed as qualitative data. Attendees discussed the use of tools such as Equality Impact Assessments and the possibility of developing a Human Rights Impact Assessment.

Lastly, conversation focussed on empowering women and girls to use their voice and feel that their voice has value and will be heard. Young people should be encouraged to participate and Youth Panels/Advisory Boards – where people are supported to engage and contribute – should be endorsed.

Additional points

- An intersectional approach which understands that no individual represents an entire community
- Consultation fatigue and exhaustion with few perceived results
- Policies can be coherent but they may not positively impact those they effect
- Decision makers have power but they may not have knowledge
- Is there a disconnect between what policy makers would like to do and what decision makers actually do
- Coherence through government, local authorities and throughout the chain

Question two

- It's 2025 and policy coherence relating to gender equality is considered world leading in Scotland by the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD) – what did we do/what changed/how did we achieve this recognition?

Summary

Discussions on what Scotland did to achieve recognition by the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD), for policy coherence relating to gender equality, focussed largely on gender budgeting and feminist economics. The benefits of gender equality have been successfully demonstrated to all and budgets are not passed unless both a gender and intersectional lens have been applied. This process would be quality monitored to ensure there is gender competence throughout the process. Gender budgeting and feminist economics would be complimented by a wellbeing economy and would inform coherent policy making and implementation. This approach to the economy would be the norm and the population of Scotland would understand the benefits of gender equality.

Discussions also focussed on early years and young people. Gender equality is built into the education curriculum and gender studies is taught from P1. Young people have led the way in making change and have more decision making power through Youth Boards and other mediums. This has occurred as we believe and trust in them to make positive societal change. As part of this, young women – and women more generally – are more represented in politics, government and local authorities, and have helped create systemic change based on kindness, love and compassion.

Collaborative working was also identified as a factor which helped Scotland to achieve policy coherence relating to gender equality. Brave, bold and transparent policies are made through a collaborative process with input from all sectors leading to more informed policy making. An intersectional approach is taken and diverse people are included in service design. As part of this collaboration there is a central knowledge sharing platform for resources, ideas, evidence and best practice.

Lastly, Scotland has hosted the World Conference on Gender Equity and there has been a paradigm shift whereby our current system cannot exist in the future. There is continuous commitment to gender equality from the Civil Service and political parties despite changes in personal and administrations in power.

Additional points

- Gender equality is no longer a topic of conversation
- *Invisible Women*, Caroline Criado-Perez, is a core text for policy makers
- Equality is mainstreamed and applies equally to the private sector – this is regulated through Human Rights Commissions
- There is employability for people with disabilities and they hold decision making positions

FIRST MINISTER'S NATIONAL ADVISORY COUNCIL ON WOMEN AND GIRLS NACWG MEETING

25 September: 13:45 – 16:00 at Out of the Blue Drill Hall, Rehearsal Room

The NACWG convened at 13:45 in the Rehearsal Room at Out of the Blue Drill Hall, Edinburgh. The Chair opened the meeting by welcoming those that could not attend the previous evening, guests and observing officials in attendance.

The meeting began with NACWG members discussing the thought provoking speeches from the three key note speakers, *Heir of the Cursed's* emotive performance, and the rich and insightful outputs from the morning Circle event. Members noted that table discussions were very analytical and the following points were discussed:

- The use – or failure to use – existing tools such as Inclusive Growth Tools which could be incredibly helpful and effective
- The longevity of gender budgeting and feminists economics and the desire for this to become common place practice and dialogue
- The need for intersectional collation and analysis of data

- Ensuring that leaders and decision makers are gender competent as well as those creating, developing and implementing policy – gender competence across the board.
- Improving accessibility to participation to ensure that all voices are heard, particularly during consultations

Following a comfort break the Chair re-opened the meeting and members discussed the outputs from the driver diagram workshop the previous day. Members shared their early thoughts around their top three recommendations to be included in the 2019 Report and Recommendations, based on their investigations over the year. The NACWG also discussed aspects of the narrative of the report that they considered important. All then agreed upon membership and timings for a smaller drafting group which would work rapidly throughout October and November before submitting the report to the First Minister on 2 December 2019.

After a very short AOB, the Chair invited all members to attend the Youth Circle taking place immediately afterwards and then brought the meeting to a close at 16:00.

**FIRST MINISTER'S NATIONAL ADVISORY COUNCIL ON WOMEN AND GIRLS
YOUTH CIRCLE SESSION
25 September 2019: 17:00 – 20:00 at Out of the Blue Drill Hall, Main Hall**

Following the success of the Youth Circle pilot in June, the NACWG hosted another event. Youth Circles, which take place after the main Circle, are aimed at 11-18 year olds accompanied by a youth worker or responsible adult. These events are Youth Worker facilitated and co-designed with the younger members of the NACWG.

The NACWG ask young people the same questions as those discussed at the main Circle and tailor them so that they can be explored in an accessible way. The two questions were explored through a creative medium of Zine production. NACWG member Katie Horsburgh introduced the event and explained the safeguarding principles enforced at the event. The NACWG Youth Circle were delighted to welcome activist and campaigner Brenna Jessie as the keynote speaker who delivered an inspiring, humorous and honest speech which was enjoyed by all. You can find out more about Brenna by following her on social media @BrennaJessie_

The young people then explored the two questions during the Zine workshop. The conversations at the Youth Circle were diverse, questioning and inspiring – you can find a summary of the outputs below.

Question 1 – Discussion and Creation of Zines

- Good policy making needs input from a wide range of people, how would you want to see this improved for women and girls' participation?

Summary

The discussions on how to improve women and girls' participation focused on the education system and the desire to implement mandatory training for teachers and educators on gender and wider equalities issues. As part of this teacher's should be trained to a good level of competency and be able to support students. There was also a desire for gender and equalities studies (including LGBTI+ identities) in the curriculum from an early age and compulsory learning in PSE lessons. The young people also felt that participation could be improved by encouraging a more inclusive attitude to menstruation, specifically in sport, allowing girls to feel comfortable, understood and supported.

The young people also discussed sport and focussed on – what they perceived to be – the perpetuation of gender stereotypes by teachers and parents. Attendees identified that gender stereotyping effects both girls and boys, with many young people encountering negative experiences – including being refused permission to participate – if they participate in a sport which is traditionally associated with the opposite gender. They suggested that participation could be improved by desegregating sports such as netball and football and allowing equal opportunities for all.

Discussions also focussed on being inclusive of faith and religious groups and creating an environment where people from all communities feel comfortable to, and *can*, participate. It was noted that women and girls were only recently permitted to wear hijabs when playing basketball and therefore only recently able to participate. The young people felt that women and girls – or anyone – shouldn't feel ashamed of their cultural and religious identities, and that more broadly, BAME communities shouldn't face discrimination that impacts their participation in sport and society more widely.

Question 2 – Creation of 'Six things Zines'

- It's 2025 and policy coherence relating to gender equality is considered world leading in Scotland by the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD) – what did we do/what changed/how did we achieve this recognition?

Summary

As part of the creative workshops the young people chose six things that would be part of their future 'Utopia' Scotland. The main themes and outputs are show below.

In their 'Utopia' Scotland the young people idealised a paradigm shift in media, film and advertisement and the way in which women and girls, as well as men and boys and those who don't identify, are represented. People will no longer feel the pressure to conform to society's sense of body stereotypes. Attendees were passionate about a future where women and girls would no longer feel pressured by society and employers to wear makeup in order to be taken seriously in a professional environment.

The young people identified that in their ideal future they would like to see more diversity, such as women, LGBTI+ and BAME representation in the justice system, specifically judges. Their utopia would also include changes to system design in education – implementing non-gendered toilets – and the removal of gendered school uniforms. Participants envisioned a future where there was no longer a stigma surrounding mental health, especially amongst men and boys, and the sentiment that ‘men don’t cry’ doesn’t exist.

Lastly, the young people envisioned a change to the Gender Recognition Act (GRA) whereby people are no longer required to pay a fee or go through the lengthy, invasive and traumatic process. They discussed a future where this process is fair and equal.

The young people’s future utopia will be kind and safe irrelevant of gender.

Additional Points

- Eradication of women’s sexual assault and harassment
- An economy whereby wages are based on skills rather than age
- Eradication of the gender pay gap – young people have ‘had enough’
- Encouraging boys and men into the 5C’s of the work sector (catering, clerical, cashier, caring and cleaning)
- A clear distinction between sex and gender in policy
- Removing gender as concept, including gendered pronouns and referring to everyone as ‘they’.