FIRST MINISTER’S NATIONAL ADVISORY COUNCIL ON WOMEN AND GIRLS

Circle Event

#GenerationEqual
WELCOME

#GENERATIONEQUAL
WITH THE VOICE OF EVERYONE WE WANT TO CREATE A SCOTLAND WHERE WE’RE ALL EQUAL – WITH AN EQUAL FUTURE. TOGETHER, WE ARE GENERATION EQUAL.

#GENERATIONEQUAL
First Minister's National Advisory Council on Women and Girls

Louise Macdonald OBE
Independent Chair
@Louisemac
Jacques Ninio’s Extinction Illusion
忍

SHO SHIN
Dr Angela O’Hagan
Independent Chair of the Scottish Government’s Equality and Budgets Advisory Group
Visioning a Gender Equal Economy

Gender budgeting for policy coherence and feminist policy change

NACWG, Circle – 25 September 2019

Dr Angela O’Hagan, WISE Centre for Economic Justice
What is Gender Budgeting?

- Challenges assumptions that budgets are gender neutral
- Examines the allocation of public resources for the impact on women and men
- Redistributes resources to advance equality between women and men
- Uses gender impact assessment, policy analysis, and gender data to reveal the different outcomes for women and men from policy and finance decisions.
- Challenges established economic models to eliminate the discriminatory outcomes.
THAT'S A NICE FOOTBALL YOU HAVE THERE, LINUS

SHALL I GIVE HIM THE STATISTICS, SIR?

IN 1978, THE AVERAGE BUDGET FOR INTERCOLLEGIATE ATHLETICS FOR MEN WAS $717,000, BUT FOR WOMEN IT WAS ONLY $141,000.
2010-20 cumulative individual impact of changes in taxes and benefits (percentage of net individual income per annum by 2020) by household income groups, gender and ethnicity (selected)
Families with a disabled adult or child particularly badly impacted

38% of households include a disabled person but contribute 71% of cuts. Households with at least one disabled adult and a disabled child lose over £8,000 (over 18% of their net income). Households with a disabled child are set to lose twice as much as households with non-disabled children.
Lone mother families even more so
What is feminist policy change?

- Seeks to improve women’s rights, status or situation
- Reduce or eliminate gender-based hierarchies
- Avoids distinction between public and private spheres – home, family, paid work, politics
- Focuses on the structures that affect women and men
- Can be identified with feminist movements
- Seeks to break down policies that result in policies that disadvantage and discriminate against women as *women* (“gender status” policies)
- Seeks to break down policies that target the unequal distribution of resources and sexual division of labour (“class-based” policies).
Using Feminist Economics

FEMINISM
Feminism is the pursuit of equality between men and women. Feminists seek economic, political, social, legal, and personal rights for women that are equal to those of men. Feminist campaigns have campaigned for major societal changes such as voting rights, re-productive rights, greater political representation and equal pay. But there is still a long way to go until men and women lead truly equal lives.

FEMINIST ECONOMICS
Values the role of unpaid work carried out by men and women, in the home & through care work.

Recognises that the economy depends not just on the production & distribution of goods and services, but on co-operation & care.

Recognises that the interests of members of the same household may differ and that resources are not necessarily shared equally.

Acknowledges that the complexity of human lives cannot always be quantified.

ECONOMICS
The word ‘economics’ comes from the Greek word ‘oikonomia’ meaning ‘household management’. But nowadays the meaning of ‘economics’ has expanded to mean the production, distribution and consumption of goods and services.

When we analyse the economy, we investigate the psychology of human behaviour and decision-making.

MAINSTREAM ECONOMICS
Has a tendency to prize money, machines & men.

M easures paid work in Gross Domestic Product (GDP), but fails to count the contribution of unpaid work.

Builds its picture of the economy as consisting of people motivated by self-interest & material goods.

Feminist economics promotes economic equality between women and men. The activities, behaviour and decisions of men and women have a major impact on our economy. But mainstream economics has a tendency to be based on men’s lives and recognises only work that is done for money.

A feminist economics perspective recognises the paid and unpaid work of both men and women.

Assumes that the influences on people’s decisions can be objectively quantified & tends to build economic theories that depend on mathematical models.
Gender budgeting as a tool for policy coherence

- Improved policymaking through more informed analysis
- Whole systems approach to policy making
- Fairer, more equal distribution of public resources and outcomes for women and men, boys and girls.

But…

? Will there be separate budgets for women and men?
? Aren’t budgets just a neutral finance procedure?
Public finance and Government Budgets are not ‘neutral’

“Surely little the State does is more important than constantly using so much of the nation’s work and wealth. Few other governmental activities so consistently affect the everyday life of citizens.”

(Heclo and Wildavsky 1981, xi The Private Government of Public Money)
Where’s the coherence?

- UK Government’s ‘Rape clause’?
- Modern Apprenticeship - inbuilt bias;
- Reductions in funding to Further Education;
- Causes and impacts of women’s poverty;
- Scotland’s world-leading legislation and policy on violence against women and girls;
- Reduced spending in public services impacts women in multiple ways – as workers, as service users, and as carers, and reinforces the need for robust, gendered household analysis;
- Social Security and support for carers – positive but limited, and highly gendered
Improving Gender Budget Analysis in Scotland

- Build women’s knowledge and engagement through SWBG and other women’s organisations;
- ‘EBAG’ – NPF – Draft Budget - Budget Scrutiny;
- Gender Budgeting focus in the proposed ‘What Works Institute’
- Consult, develop and commit to a Gender Equality Strategy for Scotland;
- Improve Equality Impact Assessment and Gender Analysis for better scrutiny inside government;
- Improve processes and procedures to conduct gender budgeting across policy, revenue raising, and resource allocation processes;
- Maximise existing levers for equality and human rights assessment.
Thank you for having me today.

Angela.OHagan@gcu.ac.uk

@WISEResearch
@swbg – Scottish Women’s Budget Group – see Facebook
@WomensBudgetGrp for resources and #WBGCommission
Gary Gillespie
Scottish Government Chief Economist
Visioning a Gender Equal Economy

Dr Gary Gillespie.
GDP – What We Measure Matters.
Changing Structure of the Scottish Economy

GVA as a % of Total, Scotland 1973 and 2016

Source: Scottish Government: Input-Output Tables.
Note: these data are not fully consistent over time because of changes in accounting systems and industrial classifications.
Non-market Household UK GVA 2014 – (£1,019bn)

Share of total non-market household GVA by activity

- Childcare, 31
- Transport, 23
- Household housing services, 15
- Nutrition, 14
- Clothing and laundry, 9
- Adult Care, 6
- Voluntary activity, 2

Source: ONS Household satellite accounts: 2005 to 2014
Scotland’s Economic Strategy
Scotland's Economic Strategy 2015. mainstreaming inclusion into our approach on growth

Figure E.1: Scotland’s Economic Framework

- **PURPOSE**
  - Increasing growth and tackling inequality are mutually supportive

- **COMPETITIVENESS**
  - Investment
  - Innovation
  - Inclusive growth

- **TACKLING INEQUALITY**
  - Internationalisation
Our Inclusive Growth Outcomes – Defining success

Productivity
- Businesses are competitive and economic growth is resilient and sustainable through business-led ‘good’ job creation.

Population
- Scotland has a sustainable working age population.

Participation
- Inequality of opportunity to access work is addressed and jobs are fulfilling, secure and well-paid.

People
- Scotland’s population is healthy and skilled and economic benefits are spread more widely, with lower levels of inequality and poverty.

Place
- Communities across Scotland have the natural and physical resources to ensure they are strong and sustainable.

Sustainability
- Sustainability is essential given environmental commitments and Net Zero target.
THE ‘Inclusive Growth’ APPROACH TO THE ECONOMY

1. Inclusive Growth story
2. Diagnose issues
3. Consult and engage
4. Prioritise
5. Action
6. Measure Progress and review

ACTIVITIES
- Benchmarking of IG indicators
- Understand root causes: ‘3 levels’
- Consultation with stakeholders
- Prioritisation: identify key criteria/group
- Policy Alignment/Structures
- Monitoring & Evaluation

Sectors
Business
Women
Young People

Understand root causes: ‘3 levels’
Consultation with stakeholders
Prioritisation: identify key criteria/group
Policy Alignment/Structures
Monitoring & Evaluation

Vision
And what about future challenges, risk and opportunities?

• Demographics, technological change, globalisation, Brexit, City region deals & big data?
• What are the implications for our inclusive growth agenda?

But economic performance varies considerably across regions – there is a 70% gap in productivity between Scotland’s most and least productive regions. And poverty is projected to rise, particularly amongst households with children.

Women still get paid less than men. For every £1 a man earns, a woman earns 83p.

In-work poverty is increasing: over half of working age adults in poverty now live in households with at least one adult in employment.
Inclusive Growth Drivers may also have a particular gender dimension…

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Inclusive Growth Drivers</th>
<th>Rank</th>
<th>Gender dimension?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Digital skills</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Caring responsibilities</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Migration</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unequal Distribution of Wealth</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Job design</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unequal Distribution of Income</td>
<td>6</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quality of employment</td>
<td>8</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transport</td>
<td>9</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Digital connectivity</td>
<td>9</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quality and cost of housing</td>
<td>9</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gender segregation</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Educational mobility</td>
<td>9</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trade union</td>
<td>9</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Energy</td>
<td>15</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Environmental Quality</td>
<td>16</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spillovers</td>
<td>17</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GVCs</td>
<td>18</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finance</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Innovation skills</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Industrial policy</td>
<td>21</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social networks</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Climate Change/ Carbon reductions</td>
<td>22</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Innovation ecosystem</td>
<td>24</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Engagement</td>
<td>24</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Business envmmt</td>
<td>26</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Government mgmt</td>
<td>27</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Innovation finance</td>
<td>27</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tax &amp; Welfare System</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trade agreements</td>
<td>30</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Legal &amp; regulatory</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
For example, digital skills are a key constraint across Scotland - only 37% of businesses are equipped with the appropriate digital skills to meet their needs, but there is also evidence of significant gender segregation.

- Females make up 19% of those employed in the digital sector in Scotland, compared to 48% in the total workforce.

- Research estimated that if women held digital jobs as frequently as men, European GDP would be enhanced by €9 billion per year.

- In 2014/15, 25% of those enrolled in computing and ICT courses at Scottish universities were female.
Inequality of caring responsibilities is more pronounced in the UK than internationally

The gap in reported time spent providing care between men and women is larger in the UK than most comparator countries.

- Childcare costs as a share of net family income are highest in the UK, and considerably higher than the Nordic comparator countries.

OECD Time Use Surveys, various years

Out-of-pocket childcare costs for a couple family: % of net family income, 2012
Inequality of caring responsibilities can prevent female labour market participation - women provide more unpaid care and are most likely to be economically inactive due to caring

- The most common reason that women are economically inactive in Scotland is ‘looking after the family/home’, while for males it is due to further/higher education or long-term sickness.

- More women than men in Scotland provide unpaid care, across all lengths of provision.
GENDER PAY GAP: FULL-TIME

Gender Pay Gap for Median Full-Time Hourly Earnings (excluding overtime) Scotland and UK April 1997 - 2018

Gender Pay Gap for Median All Hourly Earnings (excluding overtime) Scotland and UK April 1997 - 2018

Source: Scottish Government Analysis of the Annual Survey of Hours and Earnings (ASHE), ONS
Female Outcomes for the Inclusive Growth Work

Male and female employment rates, North Ayrshire and Scotland, Apr 2018 - Mar 2019

Population with degree equivalent, North Ayrshire and Scotland, 2018
National Advisory Council on Women and Girls

• Leadership – Carry out a thematic gender review of the new National Performance Framework as a catalyst for system analysis and change.

• Accountability – Create a ‘Gender Beacon Collaborative’ including Scottish Government, local authorities, a public body, third sector agency and a business to formulate a “holistic” method of tackling gender equality in work.

• Creating the Conditions – All new Scottish Government programmes are to be created with gender sensitivity in mind.
Wellbeing Economy Governments (WEGo)
Our National Performance Framework.

“As a government we recognise that economic growth is hugely important, but it must be matched by improvements in our environment, in people’s quality of life, in the opportunities available to people and the public services they have access to. As a government and as a country, the challenge this new framework sets us all is to make progress in these areas to improve wellbeing across Scotland.”

First Minister
NPF launch event, June 2018

’To focus on creating a more successful country with opportunities for all of Scotland to flourish through increased wellbeing, and sustainable and inclusive economic growth.’
Progress towards the UN SDGs & national objectives.

Collaborate in pursuit of innovative policy.

Address economic, social and environmental challenges of our time.
WEGo International Policy Approaches

POLICYLAB

The Policy Lab is a practical policy sharing platform which allows officials from around the world to work together to deliver wellbeing economies.

Areas of interest

- child poverty
- predictive analytics
- sustainable tourism
- performance frameworks
- natural capital
- inclusive growth
- wellbeing budgeting
Dr Ima Jackson
Co convenor of Glasgow Refugee Asylum and Migration Network
Heir of the Cursed

Performance
Table Discussion
Q1. Good policy making needs input from a wide range of people, how would you want to see this improved for women and girls' participation?
Q2. It’s 2025 and policy coherence relating to gender equality is considered world leading in Scotland by the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD) – what did we do/what changed/how did we achieve this recognition?
CLOSING REMARKS

#GENERATIONEQUAL
THANK YOU

≡

See you 2020!

#GENERATIONEQUAL